About "Resubmission"

HRL Editorial Board, Japan Society of Hydrology and Water Resources
14th December, 2015

During the review process of Hydrological Research Letters (HRL), four decisions are made, i.e., "Accept", "Revise", "Reject", and "Resubmission". Concerning the latter two, "Resubmission" is different from "Reject". Here we explain the difference.

Because HRL is characterized by TOP (Trans-disciplinary, Open access, and Prompt publication), the editors of HRL ask authors to revise the manuscript within 14 days in principle if the decision is "Revise". When an editor receives the reports from reviewers, and he/she judges that it is difficult to revise the manuscript within 14 days, he/she selects "Resubmission" because the rapid revision is necessary for "Prompt publication". In this case, the manuscript is considered to include not scientific errors during the review process, but many revise points. We believe that the manuscript could be greatly improved according to the constructive comments made by the reviewers, the editor, and editor-in-charge (Associate Editor), and could be resubmitted for consideration for publication in HRL. "Resubmission" in HRL may correspond to major/substantial revision in other peer-review journals. Therefore, resubmitted manuscript is accepted after adequate revision, while it is rejected after poor revision. Contrarily, "Reject" is different from "Resubmission". If an editor and editor-in-charge judge the manuscript as "Reject", it contains uncorrectable scientific fatal errors. Manuscripts without new findings and/or usefulness are also rejected.

Another case when an editor and editor-in-charge select "Resubmission" is that a manuscript has so many minor mistakes. When a manuscript is submitted to HRL, editor-in-charge checks whether it follows the "Hydrological Research Letters Guidelines for Authors". If the style of the manuscript is far from the guideline, the editor-in-charge selects "Resubmission" and asks the authors to correct minor mistakes before proceeding official review.

In each case of "Resubmission", the manuscript identification number and date of the original submission are not preserved, i.e., if the revised manuscript is resubmitted, this submission is given a new manuscript identification number and a new date of submission. Once again, "Resubmission" is different from "Reject". If the decision is
"Resubmission", authors could have a sufficient time for the revision. Please consider to resubmit the revised manuscript for consideration for publication in HRL.